Quantitative Leap! Webinar 4: Seizing Twelfth Grade to Improve Math Readiness: Senior-Year Transition Courses

With Support from the College Futures & James Irvine Foundations
### Challenge of Math Readiness: State-Level Perspective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Not Proficient</th>
<th>Total Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California Community Colleges</td>
<td>~85%</td>
<td>~234,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California State University</td>
<td>~33%</td>
<td>~20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of California</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(~18% UC-Riverside)</td>
<td>(749 students UCR)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Three hurdles for improving math readiness

• Defining readiness
• Improving effectiveness of placement processes
• Improving preparation in high school
So far in the Quantitative Leap! Webinar Series...

• 1 – **Re-Defining Math Readiness.** How higher ed institutions and systems are re-thinking math required for admission and graduation

• 2 – **Increasing Placement Accuracy.** Limitations of traditional placement exams and initiatives to improve placement accuracy

• 3 – **Improving Preparation Opportunities.** Unpacking the links between high school course-taking and math readiness

**TODAY:** Can transition math courses in the senior year ensure that more students can be college ready in mathematics?
Quantitative Leap! Brief recommended:

• College-ready opportunities for all high school students
• Multiple ways to acquire proficiency
• Senior-year transition courses
Senior-Year Transition Courses

- Pioneered by Cal State in English
  - tied to 11th grade standards test
  - ERWC – Expository Reading and Writing Course
- Multiple states have developed courses in math and English
- Avenue for becoming college-ready (exempt from dev ed)
  - the course itself
  - placement test or other standardized test
- New investment in California
  - $6.4 million Math Readiness Challenge
Today’s Discussion: What Do We Know?

• Experience with English transition courses – ERWC
• Early evidence around math transition courses nationally and in California
• Implications for college readiness and completion
• Implications for equity
Today’s Presenters

Pamela Burdman
Fellow, The Opportunity Institute

Neal Finkelstein
Senior Research Scientist, WestEd

Elisabeth Barnett
Senior Research Associate, Community College Research Center, Teachers College, Columbia University

Angela Boatman
Assistant Professor of Public Policy and Higher Education, Vanderbilt University

Pitt Turner
Professor of Mathematics, Sierra College

Send us your questions during the presentation!
Lessons from the Expository Reading and Writing Course (ERWC): Implications for 12th Grade Math Transition Courses

Neal D. Finkelstein, Senior Research Scientist, WestEd
What is ERWC?

• ERWC is a high school 12th grade English course that meets A-G requirements
• The course is carefully aligned to California’s English Language Arts standards
• The course was initially developed by the CSU 20 years ago. Refinements have been frequent and significant
• Significant partnership with K-12 colleagues to deliver support to teachers and certify the training
• Student completers enter the CSU and CCC without the need for remediation, by policy
ELA and Math in Context

• California’s 2016-17 budget asks how a program of math transition courses can mirror the success of ERWC in California

• Increasing interest statewide in how to reduce remediation rates in math at community colleges and CSU campuses
ELA and Math Sequences

- Cumulative demonstration of proficiency throughout high school is critical
- A-G details matter in practice. What a difference a three year (math) and four year (English) requirement makes to student patterns. Courses must “validate”
- Algebra proficiency is often sufficient to avoid community college remediation; high school seniors often become rusty
ERWC Evaluation Overview

- Four-year Investing in Innovation (i3) Development grant
  - Fresno County Office of Education, California State University and WestEd
- High school impact analysis and follow-on of student success in college (2 years in total)
- English Placement Test (EPT) used as outcome measure for the study
- Qualitative Implementation Data Analysis
Data

• 9 California school districts, 24 high schools
  • 56 ERWC teachers, 58 non-ERWC teachers

• 5,170 students in the study dataset
  • 3,309 students took ERWC (64%)
  • 1,861 students took a non-ERWC class (36%)
    • The non-ERWC classes were primarily English 4 and AP Literature
Matching

- Matched ERWC to non-ERWC students based on the following characteristics
  - Ethnicity and Gender
  - Grade 11 ELA California Standards Test (CST) Score
  - Grade 11 English course (AP or non-AP)
  - Average Grade 11 English grades
Impact Results

- ERWC students scored higher on the EPT compared to similar students who enrolled in other English courses.
- Results statistically significant at the 1% level.
- In other words, ERWC has a positive impact on student achievement, and this impact was unlikely to have happened by chance.
- Effect size of .13 standard deviations.
Fidelity of Implementation

• To be considered as having taught a module “with fidelity”
  • Teachers needed to complete at least one activity in each of the six strands, or level-2 sections: Prereading, Reading, Postreading, Discovering What You Think, Entering the Conversation, and Revising and Editing

• Teachers needed to teach between eight to ten modules with fidelity

• 17.9% of the study teachers taught at least eight modules with fidelity
Green = Reading Rhetorically, Yellow = Connecting Reading to Writing, Blue = Writing Rhetorically
Qualitative Data Sources

- Implementation Feedback Charts
- Coaching Logs
- Professional Learning Community Logs
Qualitative Data Analysis Findings

• Successes
  • Teachers noted high levels of student engagement and lively class discussions
  • Teachers noted improvements in students’ abilities to think critically and analyze texts in greater depth
  • Student writing improved over the year

• Challenges
  • Varying student abilities in the classroom
  • Being able to teach 8-10 modules (pacing)
Implications

• Early intervention is better; the ERWC team is interested in embedding strategies in earlier grades
• Placement guarantees are a critical policy issue. How does completing the course signal enrollment in a credit-bearing course, without remediation?
• ERWC fulfills the 4th year A-G requirement; with the 3 year A-G math requirement, the difference in sequencing can be material
The Impact of High School Transition Courses on Short-Term College Outcomes

Elisabeth Barnett, Senior Research Associate, Community College Research Center, Teachers College, Columbia University
Early college readiness assessments: Assessments administered no later than the 11th grade that measure students’ readiness to successfully perform entry-level, credit-bearing postsecondary work.

Transition curricula: Courses, learning modules, or online tutorials developed jointly by secondary and postsecondary faculty and offered no later than 12th grade to students at risk of being placed into remedial math or English in college.
Potential Of Early College Readiness Assessments

Theory:
Knowledge is power. Students and schools can take action to help students become college ready by graduation.

Evidence:
Participation in California’s early assessment (EAP) reduced students’ probability of taking remedial courses in college by 6.1 percent in English and by 4.3 percent in math.

Howell, Kurlaender, and Grodsky (2010)
Potential Of Transition Courses

Theory:
A full year course in math or English can be offered to students in the 12th grade...
• At no extra cost
• Offering high school credit
• Meeting colleges’ criteria for college readiness.
• And sometimes including a mechanism for placing out of developmental education.

Evidence:
Promising descriptive results from high schools and colleges.
Emerging more rigorous research results.
Reshaping the College Transition Research

- 50 state scan
- Report on approaches and policies - 4 states
- Implementation report - 4 states
- Impacts reports - West Virginia and New York
- Future of Transition Courses brief

Also: Report on HS momentum toward college readiness (in collaboration with Jobs for the Future)
## West Virginia: Transition Math for Seniors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Background</strong></th>
<th><strong>Specifics</strong></th>
<th><strong>Goal</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Developed by HS & College Faculty (2009)  
• Statewide implementation 2011-12  
• Replaced in 2015-16 | • Students eligible if they scored below 680 on WESTEST 2  
• Review of high school mathematics  
• Teach21 available online  
• Students take Compass test. | • College-level math readiness (to pass the Compass) |
Regression Discontinuity Design Outcomes Estimated:

### Primary
*(all within one year)*
- Math readiness at college entry
- Passing gatekeeper course

### Secondary
*(all within one year)*
- College enrollment
- College credits earned
- Developmental education credits earned
- Attempted a gatekeeper math course
Impact of Transition Math for Seniors

- Passed gatekeeper w/1 year
- College-ready upon entry
- Enroll in college w/1 year
- Attempted gatekeeper w/1 year

- College-level credits earned w/1 year
- Developmental credits earned w/1 year

**Significance levels:**
- **:** p < 0.01
- *:** p < 0.05
- **:** p < 0.01
## New York City: At Home in College (AHC) program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background</th>
<th>Specifics</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Program administered by CUNY  
• High schools volunteer to participate  
• Staggered implementation beginning in 2008-09 | • Targets students with Regents scores 65-75 (English) or 65-80 (math)  
• Students participate in subject-specific transition course  
• College knowledge component  
• Students take Compass test. | • Academic preparation to achieve college readiness in math and English  
• Help students apply and matriculate |
Difference In Differences Design
Outcomes Estimated:

**Primary**
*(all within one year)*

- College readiness at college entry in math/English
- Passing gatekeeper course in math/English

**Secondary**
*(all within one year)*

- College enrollment
- College credits earned
- Developmental education credits earned
- Attempted a gatekeeper course in math/English
Impact of At Home in College - Math

* * *
Impact of At Home in College - English

- Passed gatekeeper w/i 1 year
- College-ready upon entry
- Enroll in college w/i 1 year
- Attempted gatekeeper w/i 1 year

College-level credits earned w/i 1 year
Developmental credits earned w/i 1 year
Thoughts On Transition Courses

• There are students with many different needs below the college ready cut-off.
• Courses are informed by diverse views of college readiness.
• Courses are “owned” to different degrees by K-12 and higher education.
• Students may or may not place out of developmental education upon finishing the course.
For more information

Please visit us on the web at

http://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu

where you can download presentations, reports, and briefs, and sign-up for news announcements.

We’re also on Facebook and Twitter.

Community College Research Center
Teachers College, Columbia University
525 West 120th Street, Box 174, New York, NY 10027
E-mail: ccrc@columbia.edu Telephone: 212.678.3091
Pre-College Math Remediation in Tennessee: Examining the SAILS Program
Assistant Professor of Public Policy and Higher Education, Vanderbilt University
The Need for Remediation in Tennessee

Target Population: 13 community colleges, 6 public universities, 3 Univ. of TN campuses (~300,000 students)

Identified Need: 66% of incoming freshmen at community colleges in TN require remediation in at least one subject
  • Only 5 percent of these students graduate within three years
  • Only 25% obtain AA credential within five years

Solution: Address remedial math needs prior to college

- Tennessee Promise (college scholarships)
- Tennessee ReConnect (working adults)
- SAILS* (Seamless Alignment and Integrated Learning Support)
SAILS – Program Description

Five modules, aligned with community college remedial math competencies:

1) Real number sense and operations
2) Operations with algebraic expressions
3) Analyze graphs
4) Solve equations
5) Modeling and critical thinking

Students must pass a test at the end of each module before moving on. No comprehensive test at the end of each of the course.

When student completes all five modules, they are automatically exempted from remedial math courses at any public postsecondary institution in TN. Students who complete modules before end of the year can also enroll in dual-credit courses.
Traditional Pathway vs. SAILS

**Traditional Pathway**

- **11th Grade**: Student scores below 19 on ACT Math
- **12th Grade**: Student takes Bridge Math (curriculum not connected to remedial needs)
- **Entering College**: Student placed in remedial math (charged tuition, receives no credit)
- **1st Yr College**: Student must pass remedial requirements to begin credit-bearing courses

**SAILS Pathway**

- **11th Grade**: Student scores below 19 on ACT Math
- **12th Grade**: Student takes SAILS Math for joint credit at H.S. and at Community College
- **Entering College**: Student has completed requirements, no remediation needed
- **1st Yr College**: Student able to take college-level coursework towards graduation
1. Program implementation
What factors and conditions are associated with successful implementation of SAILS?

2. Student surveys
Are there differences in students’ experiences and attitudes about school, mathematics, and postsecondary aspirations when comparing SAILS and non-SAILS students?

3. Teacher Surveys
Are there differences in teacher practices, beliefs, or experiences when comparing SAILS and non-SAILS math teachers? What factors are associated with successful implementation of SAILS?
4. Growth in student math achievement

How do achievement gains for students in SAILS compare to those in other senior math courses? Are long-term impacts of SAILS attributable to improvements in math achievement or to a reduction of postsecondary remediation barriers?

• Data Collected: Assessment of math skills administered to 16,000 seniors in 120 high schools, conducted with students in SAILS and non-SAILS classes.

• Matched to junior year ACT score (pre-test) and to state administrative data (student, class, and teacher level)

• Research Design: Regression discontinuity analysis using the SAILS program eligibility cut-off (19 on the ACT) for sample assignment

5. Student post-secondary outcomes

Does enrolling in SAILS during the senior year of high school result in higher rates of high school graduation and college attendance, as compared to similar students not enrolled in SAILS?
Non-compliance/ Issues of Capacity

![Bar Chart]

Number of Students

Non-SAILS | SAILS

10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36
# SAILS and non-SAILS cohort (2013-14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SAILS</th>
<th>Non-SAILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACT math scores less than 19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Female</td>
<td>0.541</td>
<td>0.522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% White</td>
<td>0.773</td>
<td>0.753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Black</td>
<td>0.219</td>
<td>0.234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Hispanic</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>0.077</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean ACT Composite Score</td>
<td>16.34</td>
<td>16.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean ACT Math Score</td>
<td>15.85</td>
<td>15.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled in college</td>
<td>0.411</td>
<td>0.369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled in 2-yr college</td>
<td>0.297</td>
<td>0.221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled in 4-yr college</td>
<td>0.114</td>
<td>0.148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled in remedial math in college</td>
<td>0.159</td>
<td>0.455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled in college-level math in 1st yr</td>
<td>0.615</td>
<td>0.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>5,635</td>
<td>10,913</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Inverse Probability Weighting

Matched on prior observable characteristics:  Gender, race, 11th grade ACT score, high school information

Outcomes: graduated from high school, college enrollment, enrolled in college-level math in the first year
Impact of SAILS Math

Graduated from High School: 0.073
Enrolled in Two-Year College: 0.079
Enrolled in Remedial math: -0.037
Enrolled in College-level math in 1st yr: 0.129
Conclusions

The program has scaled-up in a short amount of time with relatively high fidelity

SAILS students report being more empowered by, and comfortable in their learning environment than their peers

Positive impact on HS graduation and college enrollment, but course enrollment mixed:
• Participating in the SAILS program appears to positively impact high school graduation and enrollment in college; these effects are being driven largely by 2-year colleges.
• SAILS students are more likely to enroll in college-level math in their first year than observationally similar students not enrolled in SAILS

Are long-term impacts of SAILS attributable to improvements in math achievement or to a reduction of postsecondary remediation barriers?
A Collaborative Effort To Reduce College-level Math Remediation

Pitt Turner, Sierra College, pturner@sierracollege.edu
ESM
Early Assessment Program Senior-year Math

Sierra College
California State University, Sacramento
Placer Joint Unified High School District
Roseville Joint Unified High School District
West Placer Unified School District
Rocklin Unified School District
Why Was ESM Created?

- We saw the same story everyone else saw...

- less than 1 percent of eligible California students did not take part

67% not ready
33% college ready
Who created ESM?

• A Regional Partnership between: Sacramento State, Sierra College, PCOE, and local feeder high schools.

• Two-year period of faculty: developing, teaching, evaluating, assessing and revising the ESM course.

• ...of course we had a lot of
How Was ESM Created?

• The content was guided by:
  The National Common Core Standards
  The California Common Core State Standards Sierra
  And Sac State’s Math Curricula
  Local High School Course Outlines
  Multiple Resources On Pedagogy

• The pedagogy was designed to:
  Allow teachers flexibility to focus on the learning, rather than preset schedule and mandates.
Where is ESM Taught?

• Placer County:
  Fall ‘13 – 4 sections at 4 high schools (pilot)
  Fall ‘16 – 25 sections at 11 high schools

• Sacramento County:
  Fall ‘14 – 3 section at 3 high schools (pilot)
  Fall ‘16 – 13 sections at 8 high schools

• The expansion is funded by:
  Basic Skills Partnership grant and the California Math Readiness grant
What Does ESM Give?

• Sierra students:
  Placement into any college-level mathematics course with a prereq of Intermediate Algebra.

• Sac State Students:
  Exemption from Early Start Program and considered to have met the college readiness requirements in math ... pending EAP status.
When Does ESM Get a “c”?  

Course meets an “a-g” requirement:  
currently meets “g” or elective  
applying for “c” math subject status

Reformatting the curriculum  
this course is a ‘living document’  
it is adaptable to local needs

– The strength of this program is:  
continuing collaboration and commitment
Sierra College Student Retention Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fall 2014</strong></td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>85% 85%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Spring 2015</strong></td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>85% 85%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summer 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>93%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fall 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>91%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Students without EAP Senior Math (ESM)
- Students with EAP Senior Math (ESM)
Sierra College Student Success Rates

- Fall 2014: 72% (Students without EAP Senior Math (ESM))
- Spring 2015: 81% (Students with EAP Senior Math (ESM))
- Summer 2015: 78% (Students without EAP Senior Math (ESM))
- Fall 2015: 81% (Students with EAP Senior Math (ESM))
Early Assessment Program
Senior-year Math (ESM)

Pitt Turner
Sierra College

pturner@sierracollege.edu
Resources

• Improving the Transition to College: Estimating the Impact of High School Transition Courses on Short-Term College Outcomes

• What We Know About Transition Courses

• Implementation of High School-to-College Transition Courses in Four States

• Seamless Alignment and Integrated Learning Support (SAILS)

• EAP Senior Math Course

• Evaluation of the Expository Reading and Writing Course
Thank You For Joining Us!

The webinar will be posted on the websites of The Opportunity Institute and LearningWorks.

For more information and to provide feedback about the QuantitativeLeap! webinar series please contact Pamela Burdman, pbstrategy@gmail.com